

City of Saginaw
Request for Proposals for Professional Auditing Services
Evaluation Criteria - Summary

<i>Evaluation Criteria</i>	<i>Max Points</i>	<i>% of Total</i>	<i>BKD</i>	<i>Patillo, Brown, Hill</i>	<i>Weaver and Tidwell</i>	<i>Brookswatson & Co</i>	<i>McConnell & Jones LLP</i>	
Mandatory Elements								
Independence	60	3%	60	60	60	60	60	#N/A
Licensed in Texas	60	3%	60	60	60	60	60	#N/A
Continuing Education	90	5%	90	90	90	70	80	#N/A
Conflict of Interest	60	3%	60	60	60	60	60	#N/A
External Quality Control Review	90	5%	90	90	90	90	90	#N/A
Reputation for Quality Audit Work	90	5%	60	65	65	60	65	#N/A
Convenient Location	90	5%	80	55	90	50	80	#N/A
Adheres to Instructions for RFP	60	3%	60	50	60	40	50	#N/A
Total Points - Mandatory	600	33%	560	530	575	490	545	#N/A
Technical Qualifications								
Expertise & Experience								
Experience and performance with similar engagements	120	7%	110	100	120	100	80	#N/A
Quality of personnel assigned to engagement	120	7%	110	110	120	90	100	#N/A
Computer expertise	90	5%	80	80	80	40	80	#N/A
Audit Approach								
Adequacy of proposed staffing	90	5%	80	70	90	70	90	#N/A
Adequacy of sampling techniques	90	5%	80	80	80	60	80	#N/A
Adequacy of analytical procedures	90	5%	80	80	80	60	80	#N/A
Total Points - Technical	600	33%	540	520	570	420	510	#N/A
Ability to Meet Stated Deadlines								
Interim Fieldwork	135	8%	135	120	135	90	135	#N/A
Audit Fieldwork	135	8%	135	120	135	90	135	#N/A
Final Report	135	8%	135	120	135	75	120	#N/A
Total Points - Deadlines	405	23%	405	360	405	255	390	#N/A
Price								
Financial Audit	165	9%	84	123	117	165	120	#N/A
	0	0%	-	-	-	-	-	#N/A
Hours Dedicated to the City of Saginaw	30	2%	24	27	24	22	30	#N/A
Total Points - Price	195	11%	108	150	141	187	150	#N/A
Grand Total Points Awarded	1800	100%	1,613	1,560	1,691	1,352	1,595	#N/A